Report to the

Faculty, Administration, Trustees and Students

Of

The City College of New York

By

An Evaluation Team representing the

Middle States Commission on Higher Education

Prepared after study of the institution's self-study report

And a visit to the campus on April 8-11, 2018

Members of the Team:

Dr. Christopher M. Fiorentino, Chair, President, West Chester University

Dr. Deborah W. Allen, Professor, Early Childhood and Family Studies, Kean University

Ms. Denise Mulkern, University Financial Officer (Ret.), University of Medicine and Dentistry of New Jersey

Dr. Susan Gerber, Assistant Vice President of Institutional Effectiveness, New Jersey City University

Dr. Jacqueline Taylor, Provost and Vice President for Academic Affairs, The College of New Jersey

Professor Beena Sukumaran, Department Head, Rowan University

Dr. Linda D. Koch, Vice President for Student Affairs (Ret.), Lock Haven University

This report represents the views of the evaluation team as interpreted by the Chair and it goes directly to the institution before being considered by the Commission.

It is a confidential document prepared as an educational service for the benefit of The City College of New York. All comments in the report are made in good faith, in an effort to assist The City College of New York. The report is based solely on an educational evaluation of the institution and of the manner in which it appears to be carrying out its educational objectives.

The team would like to thank The City College of New York community for the hospitality and assistance extended during the visit.

The City College of New York

Dr. Vince Boudreau, President

Dr. Tony Liss, Provost and Vice President for Academic Affairs

Dr. Doris Cintron, Senior Associate Provost, ALO

Carnegie Classification: Master's Colleges and Universities – Larger Programs

Distance Education: No

Control: Public

Affiliation: Government State Systems – City University of New York

Enrollment (fall, 2016): 15,948

MSCHE Liaison: Dr. Kushnood Haq

Branch Campuses: None

Degrees: Bachelor's, Doctor's – Research/Scholarship, Master's, Doctor's – Professional Practice, Post baccalaureate Award/Cert/Diploma

Approach to the Self-Study

The City College of New York presented a self-study that reviewed each standard separately. The structure of meetings during the visit enabled a standard-by-standard review, with two-person teams being assigned to meet with appropriate campus representatives for each standard and review the relevant materials in the CCNY Digital Archives. The team report is structured in this manner. The meeting schedule and participants in each of the meetings during the visit are provided elsewhere in this report.

Affirmation of Continued Compliance with Requirements of Affiliation

Based on a review of the self-study, interviews, the Verification of Compliance conducted by MSCHE and other institutional documents, the team affirms that the institution continues to meet the Requirements of Affiliation.

Compliance with Federal Requirements and Issues Relative to State Regulatory or Other Accrediting Agency Requirements

See attached email from Kushnood Haq dated May 8, 2018.

Student Achievement

See attached email from Kushnood Haq dated May 11, 2018.

Verification of Data and Self-Study Information

The team reviewed the Self-Study, reviewed numerous documents in the CCNY Digital Archives and conducted extensive interviews with members of the campus community (see attachments entitled "Meeting Participants" and MSCHE Accreditation Visit 2018 for the list of participants and the schedule of meetings with the campus community).

Evaluation Overview and Compliance with Accreditation Standards

Standard I: Mission and Goals

In the team's judgment, the institution appears to meet this standard.

Summary of evidence and findings

Based on a review of the self-study, other institutional documents, and interviews with faculty, students, and others, the team developed the following conclusions relative to the standard:

City College's mission "access to excellence" has essentially remained the same since its establishment in 1847, to educate the underserved populations of diverse students, who may be the first in their families to attend college. Currently the college offers an impressive array of graduate and undergraduate programs ranging from its longstanding humanities, arts, social sciences; and the science, technology, engineering and mathematics (STEM) offerings. In addition, the college has the only City University of New York (CUNY) School of Architecture School of Engineering and the recently established CUNY Medical School.

The current mission and goals statement was developed through a process that included internal and external participants to ensure that the resulting statement reflects the college's commitment to the "local community and global communities of knowledge and creativity". A Strategic Framework that will guide the college in the future and address its challenges was developed under the leadership of recently appointed President Boudreau and endorsed by the Faculty Senate in April, 2017.

The college identified the following institutional outcomes to be achieved using the Strategic Framework based on the selected themes:

Student Success

The college's mission to provide an affordable education to its underprepared students is noteworthy. The variety of supports provided for students to perform college level work include: The Writing Center, Gateway Academic Center, New Student Experience Center, Access/Ability Center/Student Disability Services Office of Veteran Affairs and the Student Support Services Program. That support has increased the six-year completion rate for the period 2010-2016 from 42% to 46.9%.

Promote Research, Scholarship and Creativity

With the support of philanthropic organizations, students and faculty have had opportunities to obtain national and international awards, scholarships, and participate in internships.

City College's designation as a CUNY Service Corps institution has provided paid employment opportunities for 130 students in community-based organizations and government agencies to develop requisite skills via the professional development offered at the respective agencies.

Some students have had the opportunity to work on research projects with faculty members in the Biology and Chemistry and Biochemistry Departments with the development of Opportunities in Research and Creative Activity and the Zahn Innovation Centers on campus.

Enhance Diversity

The college has a diverse student body, the undergraduate population reflects the community where the college is located in northern Manhattan: 32.57% Hispanic, 28.26% Asian or Pacific Islander, 20.24% Black, 18.73% White and .20% American Indian or Native Alaskan. The graduate student population is less reflective of the community: 37.06% White, 23.05% Hispanic, 21.19% Black, 18.59% Asian or Pacific Islander, and, 12% American Indian or Native Alaskan.

Since the last Periodic Review Report in 2013, the College has been implementing CUNYfirst for its student enrollment services which is an integrated resources and services approach which consists of human resources, financials, and procurement. Campus Solutions has also been adopted which integrates admissions, student records, student financials and financial aid. CUNYfirst and Campus Solutions make the interaction processes student-friendly which is important for students who are the first in their families to attend college.

The College's recruitment and admissions plan is based on Hobsons Connect, a customer relationship management product to personalize those processes which is also important to attract diverse students. The New York State funded program, Search for Education, Elevation, and Knowledge (SEEK) is designed to meet the needs of "economically disadvantages and academically underprepared" has specific recruitment and admissions criteria.

Although the College has expressed a need to diversify its faculty and created venues to increase the numbers of diverse faculty members such as: integrating new faculty and adjuncts into all aspects of college life, hosting a welcome orientation for new full-time faculty to provide a comprehensive view of campus life, offering Tenure and Promotion information sessions, and participating in the National Research Center in Minority Institutions Program at the National

Center of Health, an organization committed to increasing the number of under-represented scientists. Specific efforts have been made to increase the number of women in the full-time and adjunct positions. A variety of professional development opportunities have also been developed to enhance faculty members' professional growth and innovation through the various multiple university and college -sponsored initiatives. An additional resource available on campus is the Center for Excellence in Teaching and Learning which supports faculty members to enhance and develop pedagogical and technological skills, as well as application of best practices in hybrid/online instruction. Unfortunately, despite those efforts the faculty at the College has a relatively small percentage of members of under-represented groups or women.

Development of a Financial Model

The College adopted the suggestions made by the MSCHE team during the last review and by the time the subsequent Periodic Report was submitted to MSCHE, the senior administrators used CUNYfirst to streamline the integration of "financial accounting, human capital management and campus solutions".

Improve the Physical Plant

The College has developed a capital improvement plan for its facilities, but its economic situation has thwarted those activities because the College's reserves have been depleted. And has resulted in increased reliance on tuition.   Notwithstanding, cost-saving initiatives have been instituted to address the College's decreased budget, e.g. sustainability and conservation efforts, planned renovations, repairs and upgrades using a five-point priority scale ranging from projects that need "immediate attention" priority one, to those with "no sign of failure" priority five.

The Task Force on the Future of City College, consisting of a steering committee and four sub-committees which included leaders from the student body, administration, faculty, alumni association, foundation boards, and the community, was convened by President Boudreau shortly after his permanent appointment in December, 2017. The four sub-committees of the task force were organized around four themes:

- Finances: [to] construct fiscal history of the College from 2005 to present… to examine how changes in the College's budget, enrollment, revenue, spending choices, and external circumstances have created the current crisis;
- Academics: [to] consider the size, costs, and successes of the College's departments as well as the opportunities for innovation and growth in various disciplines;
- Student Services: [to] examine the effectiveness of the offices of financial aid, the bursar, and the registrar… [that will] encompass the management of student scholarships, the collection of student support, and internship services; and
- Facilities and Information Technology: [the] adequacy of funding, staffing, and plans related to the College's physical plant.

Recommendations

CCNY has relied principally on government funding is to achieve its mission. Like other top public universities CUNY must develop an effective strategy for increasing the value of its endowment, which is wholly inadequate in relation to both the College's current needs and its ambitions.

As part of its regular annual assessment work, the College should study the retention and graduation rates of different fields of study, isolating students from different admissions categories, and from different socioeconomic backgrounds to identify areas for improvement and to assess whether the College is providing "access to excellence," the core of its mission.

The College must remain committed to recruiting and retaining a diverse faculty and staff across all units and in central administration, and to increasing support and opportunities for the diverse body it currently serves.

Significant Accomplishment

The team commends the institution for taking the steps to engage the College community in an institutional review through the Task Force for the future of CCNY initiative which reflects collaborative participation for institutional development and improvement.

Standard II: Ethics and Integrity

In the team's judgment, the institution appears to meet this standard.

Summary of evidence and findings

Based on a review of the self-study, other institutional documents, and interviews with faculty, staff, students, and others, the team developed the following conclusions relative to the standard.

City College of New York (CCNY) is confronting two critical challenges: a financial deficit and recovery from administrative instability. The institution is addressing both concerns.

The financial deficit is being addressed by the taskforce that President Boudreau has set up to align the strategic framework with the prioritization of the budget for future years.

During the period of President Coico's tenure, (2010-2016), CCNY experienced numerous administrative transitions. The appointment of President Boudreau brought much-needed stability at the top of the institution but several leadership positions remain to be filled. President Boudreau's appointment is perceived positively by most of the College community.

The faculty handbook provides guidelines on promotion and evaluation. There was some dissatisfaction with the process as evidenced by feedback from the COACHE survey, which is yet to be addressed. There is a process in place for discipline and separation of faculty and staff.

Conflict of Interest procedures are evident for research activities. Research Ethics Committee (REC), is charged with implementing the CUNY conflict of interest policy. The REC protects the objectivity of research by reviewing financial interest disclosures and making recommendations to the CUNY Conflicts of Interest Committee.

The 6-year graduation rate is 46.9% and the college is taking some steps to improve graduation rates. CUNY-wide "Pathways" General Education curriculum has been implemented. The adoption of the Freshman Inquiry Writing Seminars (FIQWS) and expanding Experiential Learning Opportunities should improve graduation rates. The Early Alert and Midterm Progress Reports will allow faculty to refer struggling students to the appropriate support services. CCNY also piloted second semester learning communities as a follow up to FIQWS, but the initiative was discontinued after two years due to scheduling challenges. The faculty and staff appear to be strongly committed to improving retention and graduation rates. Revitalization of Mathematics for the Contemporary World for BA and BFA majors should also help with improving graduation rates.

The faculty is comprised of 594 FT faculty and 874 PT faculty, of which 39 percent of full-time faculty were women, and 32 percent identified with one or more minority ethnicities or races. The COACHE survey indicated that the faculty and staff wanted to diversify their ranks. It is still an ongoing challenge and is being addressed.

COACHE survey showed faculty dissatisfaction. Several steps have been taken to address the dissatisfaction including greater financial transparency, promoting better work/life balance and ensuring more diversity and equity among faculty and staff. The steps outlined in the Report of the President's Council on Inclusion and Excellence are a good first step.

Under the supervision of the Chief Diversity Officer, the Office of Diversity and Compliance is responsible for ensuring that the institution complies with CCNY, CUNY, local, state, and federal laws, policies, and procedures on equal opportunity and non-discrimination, sexual harassment, and domestic and workplace violence. The information is disseminated widely on campus.

Significant accomplishments, significant progress, or exemplary/innovative practices

The institution has taken some steps to ensure transparency in financial processes. The City University of New York (CUNY) Board of Trustees (BOT) resolution regarding reform of the Governance and Administrative Policies and Practices to Enhance Transparency and Accountability is a good start. The 21st Century foundation and the City College Fund will be merged as a result of recommendations by the CUNY BOT, effective July 2018. Financial checks have been instituted to ensure proper use of funds from the foundation. CUNYfirst, or the Fully Integrated Resources and Services Tool, will enable better management of different university functions including student administration, human resources, and finance.

The university has expanded some revenue streams such as research and development (where awards total 163.4 million) but they also face a deficit. There are processes in place at the College that will allow for strategic prioritization of the budget in the future that honors shared governance structures.

There is a commitment to academic freedom, freedom of expression and respect for intellectual property rights. Some evidence of documentation that is available online includes the faculty handbook, the CCNY medical school document on ethics and professionalism, research compliance and ethics documentation and the document from the committee that enforces academic standards.

Mentoring programs for new faculty are well developed and widely implemented across different units.

The college's enrollment is robust and diverse. In Fall 2016, CCNY enrolled 13,317 undergraduate and 2,631 graduate students, representing over 84 percent of the world's countries. The student population is 35.0% Hispanic or Latino, 22.5% Asian, 17.5% White, 16.2% Black or African American, 6.9% International, 1.5% Two, or more races, 0.3% Native Hawaiian or Pacific Islander and 0.1% American Indian or Native Alaskan. Over 42 percent of undergraduates receive financial aid from the New York State Tuition Assistance Program (TAP), and almost 51 percent are Pell Grant eligible. Approximately 41 percent of enrolled undergraduate and graduate students are first generation college students and almost 19 percent identify themselves as foreign born with over 41 percent speaking a foreign language at home. The College's tuition is affordable. The administrative leadership, faculty and staff are extremely committed to the mission of the College, which is to provide affordable education to diverse students from various socioeconomic backgrounds.

Suggestions

In the team's judgment, to improve faculty and staff morale, follow the measures outlined by the Faculty Senate COACHE resolution and the Status of Women resolution.

In the team's opinion, to continue the process of ensuring financial transparency, Foundation funds should be closely monitored and checks and balances maintained.

Standard III: Design and Delivery of the Student Learning Experience

In the team's judgment, the institution appears to meet this standard.

Summary of evidence and findings

Based on a review of the self-study, other institutional documents, and interviews with faculty, staff, students, and others, the team developed the following conclusions relative to the standard:

Undergraduate, graduate, and certificate programs

The college has developed a coherent sequence of courses for the undergraduate and graduate programs for the students, which includes provision of support as students move through the completion of degrees that support underprepared students and English-language learners. The mapping system for the undergraduates between the general education foundation courses to students' selected majors linked to the need to strengthen writing and critical thinking abilities and meet college academic requirements have been developed at the College.

The College has a rigorous system for the development or revision of courses following a cycle of needs assessment and/or recommendations from advisory boards or external reviews; availability of faculty; development of courses (syllabus, availability of faculty; contact hours, credits, academic objectives and role in the department); determined pre-requisites or co-requisites, for the implementation, monitor, evaluation and review. The proposed courses are reviewed at the respective department levels, forwarded to the divisional faculty council and the City University of New York for final approval.

The professional schools have been accredited by the pertinent professional agencies. Other programs in the departments in the College of Liberal Arts and Sciences have established cycles of self-studies, external peer evaluations, implementation plans and ongoing assessments to ensure the quality of those programs.

Faculty credentials

The full time and part time faculty possess the requisite credentials for the positions held at the College, ranging from doctorates, master's degrees, and terminal master's degrees in the School of Arts and Architecture. Full time Lecturers, who do not have doctorates hold Certificates of Continuous Employment, which affords those faculty permanent status after five years of employment. The College requires effective teaching, scholarly research and service of all faculty. Faculty members create a dossier for an annual review and reappointment.

Resources have been provided to support those areas that includes mentoring and preparing them for review and the period of time to complete positive dossiers for review has been lengthened to seven years to support those efforts with an intervening mid-review after three years.

The process of acclimating newly hired faculty to the College is a well-developed process via an orientation with representatives from all the college divisions and key offices throughout the College. The tenure and promotion processes are outlined, as well as expectations for the faculty.

Resources for professional growth are provided to the faculty. Faculty members and graduate students' pedagogical, assessment and technological skills are addressed by the Center for Excellence in Teaching and Learning.

To ensure that the quality of instruction is comparable to resident faculty, the College has developed a system of support. The Professional Staff Congress offers the adjunct faculty with an orientation session, which includes the use of Blackboard and other education technology. The adjunct faculty are provided orientations within the respective departments and the department chair outlines the culture, responsibilities linked to the academic calendar and students' needs. The adjunct faculty are evaluated semi-annually by the department chair related to performance and meeting the obligations of higher education instructional practices.

Learning opportunities and resources

The College has developed extensive learning opportunities and resources that complement the academic programs and the efforts of the faculty to meet the divergent interests and needs of the students.

Academic services include advisement offered in departments, divisions, schools, and dedicated service centers throughout the College, using a variety of platforms: including orientation sessions, online materials, websites; and, specific advising months. Academic advising, especially in the majors that have seen a rapid enrollment growth such as engineering and some of the sciences can be less than optimal. Tutoring is provided in academic departments and variety of venues throughout the College. The College library system provide services that includes "instruction, workshops, exhibitions, cultural events" as well as support in research projects. The Office of Information Technology (OIT) provides oversight of all the College's administrative, and academic technology and communication services for students and faculty. The recently opened active learning classrooms provide students access to technology enhanced learning areas that allow students to work in pairs, or groups for collaborative projects.

The College serves as a cultural arts center for the community with offerings that provide free or affordable variety of programs that reflect the diversity of the populations in the community and/or introduce new cultures to the community.

The College tries to support the full range of the abilities of students enrolled, ranging from honors, underprepared, veterans, student support services, recruitment of males to teach and Black male initiatives.

The College strives to ensure the success of all students which includes English language learners via English as a Second Language (ESL) initiatives.

The College has a variety of organizations that reflect the identities of the variety of the cultural and ethnic groups on campus.

The College has also provided opportunities for the students to participate in international learning opportunities, which has increased in the number of student participants four-fold since 2013.

As a result of the enrollment increases in engineering and some of the sciences, the number of sections of core courses required for graduation are inadequate to ensure timely graduation of students.

External Institutional Review

The College has sought and achieved accreditations from the National Architecture Accrediting Board (NAAB) for the undergraduate (BArch) and graduate (MArch) programs in the School of Architecture in 2017; the American Society of Landscape Architects (ASLA) for the Bachelor of Landscape Architecture and the Master of Landscape Architecture-First Professional Degree; the Council for the Accreditation of Education Preparation (CAEP); the Board for Engineering and Technology (ABET); the Liaison Committee on Medical Education (LCME) and the Accreditation Review Commission on Education for the Physician Assistant (ARC-PA).

Significant accomplishments

Assessment of Effectiveness of Programs

The College has created an Academic Program Review that replicates the external national accreditation processes with the establishment of a seven-year cycle for the comprehensive, academic program review of departments in the College of Liberal Arts and Sciences that consists of self-studies, external peer evaluations, implementation plans and on-going assessments.

Support for International Learning Opportunities

The number of students who participated in international learning opportunities in Europe, Africa, Asia and South America increased substantially over the last five years. The opportunities enrich the students' learning experiences and the curricula offered at the College.

Exemplary/experiential learning outcomes (ELO) and Common Core Program

The College has developed two exemplary programs that have had positive outcomes for students: the ELO and Flexible Core.

The experiential learning outcomes (ELO) offer opportunities that include students' involvement in faculty members' research, scholarship and creative activities that contribute to increased student retention and success.

The flexible core consists of six courses that introduce students to concepts and methods across a variety of disciplines that support students' abilities to analyze information from a variety of sources and produce well-written or oral arguments.

The selected exemplary approaches seem effective ways to extend students' learning beyond the relatively narrow spheres of their life experiences.

Recommendations

The team recommends that College Deans and senior administration review the need for additional courses in academic programs that delay student completion of graduation requirements, particularly in the sciences and engineering.

The team recommends that the College ensure an adequate number of professional advisors are available to serve students for timely progress towards their degree.

Standard IV: Support of the Student Experience

In the team's judgment, the institution appears to meet this standard.

Summary of Evidence and Findings

CCNY has started a number of retention initiatives since 2013. CUNYfirst, a People Soft software tool, brought about a significant change to the admission process, assessment of the retention initiatives, financial aid module and many new student-friendly features. Students enroll in classes through CUNYfirst, pay their bills on-line, view their academic and financial information and apply for graduation. It is noted that the breadth of service provided through CUNYfirst is perhaps one of the first of its kind in the nation. The college continues to install modules to assist with the admissions process.

The College monitors and assesses its Admissions practices and policies with senior level administrators and campus stake holders [i.e. Bursar's Office, Financial Aid and Registrar].

An annual assessment is completed by the Admissions Office to assess its standards used in admitting students. All of the Schools and Colleges are active participants. The Faculty Senate and Provost's Office approve enrollment and financial targets of the Admissions Office. This applies to the undergraduate and graduate programs.

CCNY has monitored and has created programs that address student needs which targets non-traditional students, first generation students, undeclared students, working adults, honors students, transfer students and graduate students. Special programs for underprepared students as well as advanced placement students are encouraged to participate in summer program offerings. Additionally, first time college students are able to take a class [NSS] to assist them with adjustments to campus life and its demands.

Orientation, advisement and counseling programs have been created for both undergraduate and graduate students attending CCNY. Programs are offered face-to-face as well as on-line.

A great deal of attention has been given to transfer students, including a special orientation program. Careful assessment is given to transfer credit situations, including experiential learning, prior non-academic learning and other alternative learning approaches.

Student records are maintained with student privacy being of utmost importance. FERPA guidelines are readily available through the Registrar's Office as well as web sites.

Athletic programs are offered to primarily undergraduate students at the NCAA Division III level. There appears to be a declining number of students participating in athletic opportunities. Student activities are available through the Department of Student Life with some 140 clubs and organizations currently in existence. Community service is also encouraged through such initiatives as CityServ, Student Empowerment Engagement Development Series [SEEDS], and the National Society for Leadership and Success.

Third party providers offer students a retail store, campus-wide dining and catering, vending services, bookstore services, campus housing, an ATM, off-campus student housing, and the MTVu Network. The coordination of the third party functions is at the direction of a 501c3 Auxiliary Enterprise Corporation [AEC]. The Vice President for Finance and several other faculty and staff members are appointed by the President the Board of Directors of the AEC. Graduate and undergraduate students also are appointed to the Board.

Assessment of student services is accomplished by participation in an annual National Survey for Student Engagement [NSSE] and the CUNY Student Experience Survey. In addition, the Student Affairs Division collects data on student needs through various on-campus service providers.

Recommendation.

The self-study noted that the College needs to remain focused on retention and completion rates of all students, and will continue to develop initiatives that join academic advising, oversight of enrollment management and communications to ensure completion of degrees in a timely fashion. It is noted that the Vice President for Student Affairs will be an interim appointment for 2017.

Standard V: Educational Effectiveness

In the team's judgment, the institution appears to meet this standard.

Summary of Evidence and Findings

Assessment of student learning and achievement has been a journey for CCNY that has involved ongoing feedback from MSCHE, particularly with regard to program-level assessment, general education assessment, and assessment doctoral program (2003, 2005, 2008, 2010, 2011, 2013). As a result, CCNY appears to have established a systematic approach to assessment that involves both annual and multi-year analyses and is utilized by most academic departments and programs. Through the efforts of the Director of Assessment and the

Assessment Committee, the Institution has used the Self-Study as an opportunity to continue the efforts started for the Periodic Review Report (PRR) and to address recommendations the PRR reviewers made. CCNY has also leveraged the Self-Study process and the 2014 Standards to reflect upon assessment outcomes from a macro level, through the use of guiding questions (p. 75).

General Education

Assessment in general education is overseen by the Office of the Provost. The Office of Assessment works with the Director of General Education and with individual faculty. The CUNY system implemented revisions to the General Education curriculum in Fall 2013, and CCNY has refined its assessment procedures as a result. Assessment is at both the course-level and the program-level. At the course level, both direct and indirect measures are employed, and changes to courses have been made based on assessment findings. At the program level,

AC&U VALUE rubrics are employed, and the Committee is beginning to examine the relationship of assessment in general education to that in the discipline.

Undergraduate and Graduate Major Programs

Given that the programs in the schools of Architecture, Education, Engineering, and Medicine have professional accreditation, CCNY has placed most of its efforts on programs in CLAS, and assessment includes several levels of coordination: Office of the Provost, Office of Assessment, Divisional Coordinators, Department Coordinators, and Department faculty teams. The majority of undergraduate programs in CLAS have mission statements, learning outcomes, and curriculum grids. The template for annual reporting includes elements related to: direct and indirect assessment instruments; results, analysis, and action plans; continuity/change with stated assessment plans and with prior results; and communication with stakeholders. Many of the reports reviewed cite action plans that flow from the assessment results. CCNY is addressing the PRR recommendation related to benchmarking in part through curricular revisions such as scaffolding of flat majors, and development/ refinement of cornerstones and capstones.

CCNY has moved to address the PRR recommendation regarding utilizing assessment results in planning and budget by augmenting the academic program review (APR) process. Specific changes include improving the financial support for program review and encouraging stronger focus on direct assessments. The APR for Psychology was conducted after this change and analyses and recommendations reference planning and budget. Onsite interviews confirmed that departments develop action plans for improvement and that these plans are discussed with administration.

The assessment framework for graduate programs is similar to that for undergraduate. CCNY reported on advances in assessment of Master-level programs and the PhD programs in Engineering in its 2013 PRR. Additional examples of the use of assessment data are provided in the Self-Study.

Assessment of Assessment Processes

CCNY has used the Self-Study as an opportunity to reflect on its assessment practices. The institution has made suggestions for its own growth: (a1) create a portal for sharing and utilizing assessment information and results, (a2) establish an institutional assessment plan with benchmarks, (b1) enhance availability of real-time and flexible institutional-level assessment data, and (b2) provide professional development related to using data.

Suggestions

The team endorses the suggestions made by CCNY, and suggest that specific attention be given to the development of an institutional assessment plan with benchmarks. The Institution should draw on data from Institutional Research, which possesses statistics on student enrollment, retention and graduation, and degree attainment.
The team suggests that CCNY continues efforts to use academic program review findings for planning and resource allocation and expands efforts to use the process to examine students' attainment of program-level learning outcomes.

Standard VI: Planning, Resources, and Institutional Improvement

In the team's judgment, the institution does not appear to meet this standard.

Summary of Evidence and Findings

Based on a review of the City College of New York (CCNY) self- study, other institutional documents and interviews with faculty, staff, students and others, the team developed the following conclusions relative to the standard.

The CCNY self-study references several efforts related to their institutional planning processes over the past several years. Some are of a historical nature such as 2013-2016 Strategic Plan that was coordinated under a previous president, but was not finalized or implemented prior to her abrupt departure. Transitional leadership placed a focus on use of a Strategic Framework document which extracted several core goals from the prior strategic planning effort. This was intended to guide budget activities, but unfortunately the timing of three successive years of CUNY resource reductions impeded the College's ability to implement such strategies for budget allocations or reallocations with this document. This circumstance has resulted in the College not meeting the criteria of Standard VI in regards to having a financial planning and budgeting process that is aligned and linked with the College's strategic plans & objectives.

Once a new permanent President was named, the budget situation was assessed and he communicated to the CCNY community that a structural deficit of $8.7 million existed and needed to be addressed to stabilize and strengthen the College for the future. The President has been transparent in communicating these issues to the college community and has engaged its constituents through a Task Force on the Future of City College. This taskforce is

coordinated through four (4) subcommittees – Finances, Academics, Student Services and Facilities & Information Technology. Its activities are anticipated to continue through at least June 2018 and will be a transitional process to identify future strategies for consideration and impact in future budgets (FY 2019 and FY2020). Once available, the College will be in a position to consider the realignment of resources to support the College's missions and goals

The College's operating budget is comprised primarily of a combination of CUNY support, tuition revenue and fundraising.   It was noted in discussions that overall CUNY funding has decreased each of the last few years and has presented fiscal challenges to the College. Further review of the consolidated budget forecasts through 12/31/17 identified that the School of Medicine financial resources are not anticipated to be fully utilized this year and are under consideration by CUNY to be made available to cover the deficit spending in the other CCNY units. Such action would allow for CCNY to bridge certain fiscal challenges while the Taskforce activities are underway.

Discussions occurred with the CUNY Board of Trustees and certain executive leadership of the CUNY system which reflected their recognition of the academic importance of the medical school at CCNY and also the importance of fiscal resources to support its growth.

The team noted that the College has taken important steps to enhance fundraising capabilities through a merged foundation structure as of July 1, 2018 and improved internal controls. It is anticipated that this will provide opportunities for increased resources that can be linked with strategic needs of the College.

An all funds budget model inclusive of the tax levy budget, fundraising and research activities is in the final stages of development and will be an important tool in budget transparency efforts. This model will better inform College units regarding their available resources. Once fully implemented, these activities will be important to budget monitoring and information sharing among the College community.

Since CCNY is part of the CUNY system, its financial information is consolidated and audited as part of the CUNY 2017 audit which was performed by KPMG. However, CCNY financial information is not separately presented. The team reviewed the 2017 audit report for CUNY and noted that it did not reflect any problematic issues related to CCNY within the footnote disclosures of the audit report. Management has indicated that there has been no current activity or update related to the Federal subpoena that was issued in 2016.

The self-study cites effective use of technology to streamline administrative processes related to the Tuition Assistance Program (TAP) eligibility through Degreeworks software and better tracking of fundraising activities through Financial Edge NXT software. Process improvement type initiatives such as these are important as the College focuses on ways to deal with reduced operating resources. An additional initiative to evaluate all administrative processes will occur through an Administrative Assessment Committee.

The capital project and infrastructure needs of CCNY are coordinated through the CUNY system five-year capital plan process. Significant capital activities of approximately $239 million are reflected and funded in the CCNY capital summary and relate to important facility needs of the

College.   These capital plan projects are primarily resourced through a CUNY funded program, while the operating and maintenance budget of the CCNY facilities is part of the general operating budget of the College.

CCNY has identified initiatives to stabilize and strengthen the operations of the College. These initiatives, which are key criteria of Standard VI, have varying timelines for completion and implementation and will need to be monitored and assessed as they are implemented.

Recommendation

Information developed and identified through the Task Force on the Future of City College should be used as a foundation for future strategic planning efforts. Using this foundation, it is recommended that the institution develop a formal strategic plan that addresses stable administrative leadership and clear concise budgeting processes that are linked with strategic plans and objectives.

Standard VII: Governance, Leadership and Administration

In the team's judgment, the institution appears to meet this standard.

Summary of Evidence and Findings

CUNY has a Board of Trustees, appointed by the Governor of the State of New York and Mayor of New York City, that is given the authority to develop and review policy, and resource development that is consistent with the college's mission. The seventeen-member Board has sufficient autonomy to insure institutional autonomy and fulfill its responsibilities of policy and resource development. The Board of Trustees also approves personnel actions; allocates both operating and capital budgets; and reviews governance documents. Clearly the public interest is the responsibility of the Board of Trustees. Established By-Laws outline all of the duties of the Board's membership and the CUNY Central Office also implements and reviews policies established by the Board.

According to the information provided, the Board and the CUNY Central Office appear to provide a form of checks and balances in terms of governance and oversight of financial matters. The Central Office has responsibility for the supervision of presidential appointments, negotiation of collective bargaining agreements, all personnel actions, philanthropic gifts and curricular initiatives are reviewed by the staff of the Chancellor's Office and shared with the Board for final approval.

In accordance with MSCHE criteria, the President has the authority and the autonomy to develop and implement institutional planning processes, staffing the organization and assessing the organization's efficiencies and effectiveness. It must be noted that the President has only been permanently in office since December, 2017, having served as the interim President for

about a year or so. Dr. Boudreau had been the Dean of the Colin Powell School for Civic and Global Leadership.

As the self-study reveals, there has been an upheaval in the leadership of the College that began with the resignation of the President in October 2016. The administrative leadership of the College has also been in a "state of transition" with numerous interim appointments in almost all of the senior level positions.

The impact of the transitory nature of the College's senior staff has caused a serious delay in the planning and budgeting processes of the institution. It appears as though the planning and budgeting process has been redefined and restructured. Along with numerous changes in staffing, an outline of a strategic framework has been developed with campus involvement and it appears in the Appendices. The campus leadership continues to work on identifying strategic initiatives to address financial shortfalls by May 2018 and is called the Task Force of the Future of CCNY.

The budgeting process has been redesigned to meet the current fiscal challenges of the College and the interim nature of the senior administrative structure. As was stated in the self-study in Standard VI, every attempt has been made to make the budgeting process transparent.

The self-study states, "At present, CCNY is confronting two critical challenges: a financial deficit, which is thoroughly discussed in Standard VI, and recovery from administrative instability." p. 124. Later in the document, [p. 125] it states, "Despite these disruptions, CCNY has consistently maintained and delivered an outstanding education and extensive academic support to its students, because of the leadership and unwavering dedication demonstrated by the faculty, middle management, and staff."

In order to meet the criteria of Standard VII, the stabilizing of the staffing of the College, the completing of the process identified as the "Task Force of the Future of CCNY," and the final definition of the College-wide Personnel and Budgeting Committee responsibilities need to be addressed. Timelines for the completion of the processes, the committee and the administrative appointments noted in the self-study, were not completed at the time of the MSCHE visit.

The College clearly has a mission and goals that have been highlighted throughout the self-study. As the flagship institution of the CUNY system, there are many distinctions that have been highlighted in the self-study. However, leadership transitions and instability have impeded or jeopardized forward momentum. Stabilizing the leadership team and continuing to repair and restore trust and well-functioning governance structure will require a definite commitment in order to sustain the distinction that has been earned.

Significant Accomplishment

Over the past five years, the CCNY Faculty Senate has played a strong and constructive role in articulating a faculty perspective on mission critical deliberations, especially as the institution has confronted financial difficulties and leadership transitions.

Recommendations

The College has committed to explore ways of including staff representation in governance and policy.

The College should explore administrative transitions as opportunities to facilitate and increase diversity in the College's Senior Executive staff.

The College should continue to examine and review the advisory and governance roles of the President's Cabinet and the College Review [i.e. College Personnel and Budget Committee] to increase effectiveness and maximize transparency in College decision making.

MSCHE ACCREDITATION VISIT 2018

MONDAY - APRIL 9

TIME	Dr. Chistopher Fiorentino	Ms. Denise Mulkern	Prof. Beena Sukumaran	Dr. Linda Koch	Dr. Susan Gerber	Dr. Deborah Allen	Dr. Jacqueline Taylor
9:00	PRESIDENT'S CABINET LOC: A310						
10:00	PRESIDENT LOC: A300 PROVOST LOC: A305	CHIEF OPERATIONS OFFICER/ CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LOC: A306A		FACULTY GOVERNANCE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE LOC: A310	STUDENT AFFAIRS; ACADEMIC SUPPORT LOC: A201	FACULTY GOVERNANCE; EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE LOC: A310	
11:00	STANDARD 1 WORKING GROUP LOC: NAC 5/225	STANDARD 2 WORKING GROUP LOC: NAC 4/220B		STANDARD 4 WORKING GROUP LOC: A201		STANDARD 1 WORKING GROUP LOC: NAC 5/225	REVIEW DOCUMENTS LOC: SH150
Noon	LUNCH: CUNY BOARD of TRUSTEES) LOC: Private Dining Room (Faculty Dining Room)				LUNCH: ASSESSMENT COMMITTEE LOC: President's Dining Room (Faculty Dining Room)		
1:00	REVIEW DOCUMENTS LOC: SH150	STEERING COMMITTEE LOC: NAC BALLROOM					
2:00	STANDARD 6 WORKING GROUP LOC: A310		INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY LOC: NAC 4/225F	STANDARD 7 WORKING GROUP LOC: A201	REVIEW DOCUMENTS LOC: SH150	INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY LOC: NAC 4/225F	STANDARD 7 WORKING GROUP LOC: A201
3:00	OPEN STUDENT FORUM LOC: NAC BALLROOM		REVIEW DOCUMENTS LOC: SH150	OPEN STUDENT FORUM LOC: NAC BALLROOM			
4:00	PRESIDENT LOC: A300	REVIEW DOCUMENTS LOC: SH150	STANDARD 3 WORKING GROUP LOC: A201	REVIEW DOCUMENTS LOC: SH150	STANDARD 5 WORKING GROUP LOC: NAC 1/103 (BOOKSTORE)	STANDARD 3 WORKING GROUP LOC: A201	STANDARD 5 WORKING GROUP LOC: NAC 1/103 (BOOKSTORE)
5:00	TEAM MEETING LOC: Hotel Beacon Conference Room						
7:30	TEAM DINNER						

Legend

NORTH ACADEMIC CENTER		
WILLE ADMINISTRATION BUILDING		
SHEPARD HALL		

MSCHE ACCREDITATION VISIT 2018

TUESDAY - APRIL 10

TIME	Dr. Chistopher Fiorentino	Ms. Denise Mulkern	Prof. Beena Sukumaran	Dr. Linda Koch	Dr. Susan Gerber	Dr. Deborah Allen	Dr. Jacqueline Taylor
9:00	PRESIDENT LOC: A300	CUNY Board of Trustees (Mayra Linares) LOC: A201	DEVELOPMENT LOC: SH154	CUNY Board of Trustees (Mayra Linares) LOC: A201	DEVELOPMENT LOC: SH154	REVIEW DOCUMENTS LOC: SH150	
10:00			HUMAN RESOURCES LOC: A306A				
11:00		DIVISIONAL DEANS LOC: A201					
Noon	LUNCH LOC: PRESIDENT'S DINING ROOM (FDR)						
1:00		FACILITIES LOC: A201		DEPARTMENT CHAIRS LOC: NAC 4/220B	FACILITIES LOC: A201	DEPARTMENT CHAIRS LOC: NAC 4/220B	
2:00		FACULTY SENATE DIVERSITY COMMITTEE LOC: NAC 4/220	ENROLLMENT SERVICES LOC: A310	STUDENT GOVERNMENT LOC: NAC 1/103 (BOOKSTORE)		GENERAL EDUCATION COUNCIL LOC: A201	
3:00	OPEN FACULTY & STAFF FORUM LOC: NAC 1/103 (BOOKSTORE)						
4:00	PRESIDENT LOC: A300		FINANCE DEPARTMENT LOC: A306A				FINANCE DEPARTMENT LOC: A306A
5:00	TEAM MEETING LOC: Hotel Beacon Conference Room						
7:30	TEAM DINNER						

NORTH ACADEMIC CENTER							
WILLE ADMINISTRATION BUILDING							
SHEPARD HALL							

PRESIDENT'S CABINET	
Vince Boudreau	President
Ardie Walser	Associate Dean for Academic Affairs, Engineering
Arshaw Ramkaran	Director, Financial Aid
Charles Stewart	Associate Dean, Library
David Jeruzalmi	Chair, Faculty Senate
David Robinson	AVP of Facilities
Dee Dee Mozeleski	Director, Institutional Advancement & Communications
Doris Cintrón	Sr. Associate Provost
Erec Koch	Dean, Humanities & Arts
Felix Lam	VP and Chief Financial Officer
Geraldine Murphy	Director, Honors Center
Gordon Gebert	Interim Dean, Architecture
Juan Carlos Mercado	Dean, Interdisciplinary Arts and Sciences
Ken Ihrer	AVP of IT, Chief Information Officer
Kevin Foster	Interim Dean, Colin Powell School
Leonard Zinnanti	SVP and Chief Operating Officer
Mary Driscoll	Dean, School of Education
Mary Ruth Strzeszewski	Associate Provost
Pat Morena	Executive Director, Public Safety & Security
Paul Occhiogrosso	Executive Counsel to the President
Tony Liss	Interim Provost
V. Parameswaran Nair	Interim Dean, Science
Wendy Thornton	Interim Vice President, Student Affairs

CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER / CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER	
Felix Lam	VP and Chief Financial Officer
Leonard Zinnanti	SVP and Chief Operating Officer

HUMAN RESOURCES	
John Siderakis	AVP of Human Resources
Leonard Zinnanti	SVP and Chief Operating Officer
Virgina Rodriguez	Associate Director of Human Resources

OFFICE OF INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY	
Juan Baez	Director of Application Development; Office of Information Technology
Ken Ihrer	AVP of IT, Chief Information Officer
Leonardo Leon	Deputy Chief Information Officer
Otto Marte	Sr. Director of Business Services (OIT)
Vern Ballard	Director of Client Support and Information Security Officer, OIT

FACILITIES	
David Robinson	AVP for Facilities
Len Zinnanti	SVP and Chief Operating Officer
Khadesha Maxim	Chief of Staff, Facilities
Vatthana Chin	Facilities Planning Director, Facilities

ENROLLMENT SERVICES	
Alan Sabal	Sr. Associate Director of Admissions
Anthony Ricca	Interim Bursar
Arshaw Ramkaran	Director, Financial Aid
Leon Tachauer	Director of Scheduling and Workload
Shailesh Thacker	Director, Evaluation and Testing

CUNY BoT	
Charles Shorter	Trustee
Mayra Linares-Garcia	Trustee

FINANCE DEPARTMENT	
Felix Lam	VP and Chief Financial Officer
Leonard Zinnanti	SVP and Chief Operating Officer
Eva Medina	Director of Budget, Finance and Administration
David Jeruzalmi	Chair, Faculty Senate
David Rumschitzki	Faculty, Chemical Engineering (Engineering)

DEVELOPMENT OFFICE	
Dee Dee Mozeleski	Director, Institutional Advancement & Communications
Martin Cohen	Board Member, The Foundation for City College
Stephen Karafiol	Board Member, The Foundation for City College

FACULTY GOVERNANCE / EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE	
Chris Li	Chair, Faculty Council
David Jeruzalmi	Chair, Faculty Senate
Elise Crull	Faculty, Philosophy (Humanities & Arts)

FACULTY SENATE DIVERSITY COMMITTEE	
David Jeruzalmi	Chair, Faculty Senate
Kathlene McDonald	Chair, Center for Worker Education
Michele Baptiste	Chief Diversity Officer; Dean of Faculty Relations

COUNCIL OF DEANS

Ardie Walser	Associate Dean for Academic Affairs (Engineering)
Erec Koch	Dean, Humanities & Arts
Erica Friedman	Deputy Dean, CUNY School of Medicine
Gordon Gebert	Interim Dean, School of Architecture
Juan Mercado	Dean, Center for Worker Ed
Kevin Foster	Interim Dean, Colin Powell School
V. Parameswaran Nair	Interim Dean, Science

DEPARTMENT CHAIRS

Ben Vilhauer (H&A)	Chair, Philosophy (Humanities & Arts)
Edwin Lamboy (EDU)	Chair, Secondary Education (School of Ed)
Eitan Friedman (CSoM)	Faculty, Chair; Molecular, Cellular & Biomedical Sciences (CSoM)
Hazel Carter (EDU)	Chair, Dept of Leadership & Special Education (School of Ed)
Jerry Carlson (H&A)	Chair, Media and Communication Arts (Humanities & Arts)
Kyle McDonald (SCI)	Chair, Earth and Atmospheric Sciences (Science)
Molly Aitken (H&A)	Chair, Art (Humanities & Arts)
Swapan Gayen (SCI)	Chair, Physics (Science)

STUDENT AFFAIRS / ACADEMIC SUPPORT PROGRAMS

Wendy Thornton	Interim Vice President, Student Affairs
Debbie Edwards-Anderson	Advisor, Early Childhood Education (Center for Worker Education)
Dominic Stellini	Executive Director, Student Engagement Initiatives
Elizabeth Thangaraj	Director, Student Support Services Program
Hawai Kwok	Coordinator of SEEK tutoring and Academic Support
Leon Tachauer	Director of Scheduling and Workload
Lydia Gerson	Director, Gateway Academic Center
Melissa Oden	Academic Advisor, Humanities & Arts
Migen Prifti	Academic Advisor, Humanities & Arts
Millie Roth	Deputy Dean of Science for Undergraduates
Rawlins Beharry	Director, Office of Student Development (Engineering)
Raymond Strom	Academic Advisor, Humanities & Arts
Shailesh Thacker	Director, Evaluation and Testing
Sherri Rings	Counselor, SEEK
Stacia Pusey	Assistant Dean, Enrollment and Student Services (School of Ed)
Svetlana Bochman	Director, The Writing Center

STEERING COMMITTEE

Doris Cintrón	Sr. Associate Provost
Edwin Lamboy	Chair, Secondary Education (School of Education)
Carlos Riobo	Chair, Classical and Modern Languages (Humanties & Arts)
David Jeruzalmi	Chair, Faculty Senate
Ellen Handy	Faculty, Art History (Humanities & Arts)
Eva Medina	Director of Budget, Finance and Administration
Fred Moshary	Faculty, Electrical Engineering (Engineering)
Geraldine Murphy	Faculty, English; Director, Honors Center
I-Hsien Wu	Faculty, Classical and Modern Languages (Humanities & Arts)
Jane Gallagher	Faculty, Biology (Science)
Joshua Wilner	Faculty, English (Humanities & Arts)
Kathy Powell-Manning	Director of Assessment
Kenneth Ihrer	AVP of IT; Chief Information Officer
Kevin Foster	Interim Dean, Colin Powell School
Leonard Zinnanti	SVP and Chief Operating Officer
Marta Gutman	Faculty, School of Architecture
Mary Ruth Strzeszewski	Associate Provost
Renata Miller	Deputy Dean, Humanities & Arts
Terri Watson	Faculty, Leadership & Special Ed (School of Ed)
Thomas Castiglione	Registrar
Tony Liss	Interim Provost
Tricia Mayhew-Noel	IRB Administrator, Research and Sponsored Programs
Wendy Thornton	Interim Vice President, Student Affairs
Yvel Crevecoeur	Faculty, Leadership & Special Ed (School of Ed)

STANDARD I

David Jeruzalmi	Chair, Faculty Senate
Renata Miller	Deputy Dean, Humanities & Arts
Ardie Walser	Associate Dean for Academic Affairs, Engineering
Gordon Gebert	Interim Dean, Architecture
Rajan Menon	Chair, Political Science

STANDARD II

Jane Gallagher	Faculty, Biology (Science)
Tricia Mayhew-Noel	IRB Administrator, Research and Sponsored Programs

STANDARD III

Charles Stewart	Associate Dean, Library
Geraldine Murphy	Faculty, English; Director, Honors Center
Hannah Borgeson	Graduate Student Services Manager, Architecture
Marta Gutman	Faculty, School of Architecture

STANDARD IV	
Dani McBeth	Associate Dean for Student Affairs, CUNY School of Medicine
Joseph LoGiudice	Director, Accesibility/Disability Services
Mary Ruth Strzeszewski	Associate Provost
Teresa Scala	Special Projects Administrator
Terri Watson	Faculty, Leadership & Special Ed (School of Ed)

STANDARD V	
Kathy Powell-Manning	Director of Assessment
Ana Vasović	Director, General Education
Annita Alting	Director of Planning, Reporting, & Assessment (Engineering)
Ardie Walser	Associate Dean for Academic Affairs, Engineering
Barbara Syrrakos	Faculty, History
Debbie Edwards-Anderson	Advisor, Early Childhood Education (Center for Worker Education)
Ed Silverman	Director, Institutional Research
Elizabeth Rudolph	Assistant Dean (Science)
Fred Moshary	Faculty, Electrical Engineering (Engineering)
Leslie Galman	Director of Academic Administration, Colin Powell School
Nancy Tag	Chair, Ad/PR
Richard Braverman	Lecturer, English
Sean Boson	Faculty, Organic Chemistry
Tom Peele	Faculty, English (Humanities & Arts)
Vanessa Valdez	Faculty, Classical & Modern Languages & Literatures

STANDARD VI	
Leonard Zinnanti	SVP and Chief Operating Officer
Marie Brewer	Executive Coordinator, SVP Office
Ashiwel Undieh	Associate Provost for Research
Candice Baptiste-Sexton	Grants Manager, Grants and Sponsored Programs
David Robinson	AVP for Facilities
Eva Medina	Director of Budget, Finance and Administration
Felix Lam	VP and Chief Financial Officer
Kevin Foster	Interim Dean, Colin Powell School

STANDARD VII	
Alan Feigenberg	Director of M.S. in Sustainbility, Architecture
Alessandra Benedicty	Faculty, Center for Worker Ed
Annita Alting	Director of Planning, Reporting, & Assessment (Engineering)
Carlos Riobó	Chair, Classical & Modern Languages & Literature
Devid Paolini	Faculty, Classical & Modern Languages & Literatures
Elena Romero	Academic Advisor, Center for Worker Ed
I-Hsien Wu	Faculty, Classical & Modern Languages & Literatures
John Calagione	Academic Advisor, Center for Worker Ed.
Juan Carlos Mercado	Dean, Interdisciplinary Arts & Sciences
Maurizio Trevisan	Dean, CUNY School of Medicine
Susanna Schaller	Faculty, Center for Worker Ed

ASSESSMENT COMMITTEE	
Kathy Powell-Manning	Director of Assessment
Ana Vasovic	Director of General Education
Ardie Walser	Associate Dean for Academic Affairs (Engineering)
Debbie Edwards-Anders	Advisor, Early Childhood Education (Center for Worker Education)
Elizabeth Rudolph	Assistant Dean (Science)
Elizabeth Thangaraj	Director, Student Support Services Program
Fred Moshary	Faculty, Electrical Engineering (Engineering)
Leslie Galman	Director of Academic Administration, Colin Powell School
Migen Prifti	Academic Advisor, Humantities & Arts
Richard Braverman	Faculty, English (Humanities & Arts)
Svetlana Bochman	Director, Writing Center
Tom Peele	Faculty, English (Humanities & Arts)

GENERAL EDUCATION COMMITTEE	
Ana Vasovic	Director of General Education
Bettina Lerner	Faculty, Classical and Modern Languages (Humanities & Arts)
Edward Keller	Faculty, Media and Communication Arts (Humanities & Arts)
Ethan Akin	Faculty, Math (Science)
Geraldine Murphy	Director, Honors Center
John Krinsky	Faculty, Political Science (Colin Powell School)
Joshua Wilner	Faculty, English (Humanities & Arts)
Mara Washburn	Counselor, SEEK
Raymond Strom	Academic Advisor, Humantities & Arts
Richard Steinberg	Faculty, Secondary Science Education (School of Ed)
Tom Peele	Faculty, English (Humanities & Arts)

From:	Kushnood Haq <khaq@msche.org>
Sent:	Friday, May 11, 2018 4:55 PM
To:	Fiorentino, Christopher
Subject:	RE: CCNY Report

Hi Chris:
Both compliance report and peer reviewers compliance review are already available on MSCHE. You don't need to worry about it.
Thanks for all your work, and have a great weekend.
Kushnood

Kushnood Haq, M.B.A., Ph.D.
Vice President
Middle States Commission on Higher Education
3624 Market Street
Philadelphia, PA 19104
Office: (267) 284-5023
Khaq@msche.org
www.msche.org

From: Fiorentino, Christopher <CFiorentino@wcupa.edu>
Sent: Friday, May 11, 2018 1:42 PM
To: Kushnood Haq <khaq@msche.org>
Subject: RE: CCNY Report

Kushnood,

The Report template states that the compliance reviewer's report is to be attached to our report. I do not recall seeing this report in any of the materials I received. Can you give me some guidance on this?

Thanks,

Chris

Christopher M. Fiorentino
President
West Chester University

From: Kushnood Haq [mailto:khaq@msche.org]
Sent: Tuesday, May 08, 2018 10:30 AM
To: Fiorentino, Christopher
Subject: RE: CCNY Report

Hi Chris:

You don't have to actually put the data in your report. You should just state that the team examined and confirmed the data as per relevant standards (III, IV, and V). Unless the institution was in non-compliance with student-related standards, you just need to state that data was examined, and the institution is in compliance.

I hope this helps, but if you have additional questions, please feel free to contact me

Regards,

Kushnood

Kushnood Haq, M.B.A., Ph.D.
Vice President
Middle States Commission on Higher Education
3624 Market Street
Philadelphia, PA 19104
Office: (267) 284-5023
Khaq@msche.org
www.msche.org

From: Fiorentino, Christopher <CFiorentino@wcupa.edu>
Sent: Tuesday, May 08, 2018 9:58 AM
To: Kushnood Haq <khaq@msche.org>
Subject: CCNY Report

Kushnood,

I am working on finalizing the CCNY report and the template calls for inclusion of three years of student data. I cannot locate the data in any of the materials that were sent to me. Can you let me know where I can get access to the data?

Chris Fiorentino

Christopher M. Fiorentino
President
West Chester University